

Review Rubric for Teaching Cases

Reviewers: Please complete and return this form when reviewing a manuscript. If you have annotated the manuscript, please return that file with this form.

Review Design: The review rubric is designed to allow you to quantify your responses to various features of the manuscript and provide notes to support your responses. As such:

- If you **highlight** 3, 2, or 1, identify what is absent in the section of the manuscript.
- If you **highlight** 6, 5, or 4, identify ways to strengthen that section in ways that would lead to a publication decision or otherwise improve the manuscript.

Manuscript File Code:
Manuscript Title:

Comment Category 1: Publishing Recommendation

Please highlight only one recommendation:	Accept	Accept with minor revisions	Revise and resubmit for consideration	Reject
Please briefly explain your decision:				

Comment Category 2: Overall Fit with the *Transactions*

Does the manuscript clearly fall within the scope and address the audience of our *Transactions* (<https://procomm.ieee.org/transactions-of-professional-communication/>)?

Yes No

Does the manuscript cite literature in technical and professional communication (and other fields if appropriate) that our readers interested in the topic will be familiar with?

Yes No

Comment Category 3: Abstract

The abstract (200-250 words) is structured using the following subheadings: Introduction, About the Case, Situating the Case, Methods/Approach, Results/Discussion, and Conclusions.

Strongly Agree	Agree	Somewhat Agree	Somewhat Disagree	Disagree	Strongly Disagree
6	5	4	3	2	1

Notes on Abstract:

Comment Category 4: Introduction

The introduction explains the purpose and type of teaching case and its significance to education and training in professional communication. It states the questions that guided the study and defines unfamiliar terms or concepts. It forecasts the main sections of the manuscript.

Strongly Agree	Agree	Somewhat Agree	Somewhat Disagree	Disagree	Strongly Disagree
6	5	4	3	2	1

Notes on Introduction:

Comment Category 5: About the Case

This section explains the situation, problem, or opportunity that inspired examination of the teaching case. It also addresses important constraints or challenges that existed. If applicable, this section describes the process for developing the solution to the problem, including key milestones, activities, issues, decisions, and/or team reactions or interactions.

Strongly Agree	Agree	Somewhat Agree	Somewhat Disagree	Disagree	Strongly Disagree
6	5	4	3	2	1

Notes on About the Case:

Category 6: Situating the Case

This section situates the current teaching case in relation to issues, practices, pedagogies, research, and/or theories in the field, and, if applicable, to other similar cases.

Strongly Agree	Agree	Somewhat Agree	Somewhat Disagree	Disagree	Strongly Disagree
6	5	4	3	2	1

Notes on Situating the Case:

Comment Category 7: Methods/Approach

This section explains (1) what data were collected to examine the case, (2) how the data were collected (i.e., Google Analytics, usability test methods, performance evaluation methods and criteria, etc.), (3) how the data were studied and interpreted (i.e., statistical methods, thematic coding, etc.), and (4) why the author(s) used these methods. It also addresses the trustworthiness and credibility of the data collected to examine the case. Finally, the section must indicate that an Institutional Review Board or its equivalent has approved the study’s use of human subjects or that it was exempt.

Strongly Agree	Agree	Somewhat Agree	Somewhat Disagree	Disagree	Strongly Disagree
6	5	4	3	2	1

Notes on Methods/Approach:

Comment Category 8: Results/Discussion

This section describes the study findings and the extent to which the findings address the original problem or answer the original question(s). It interprets the findings through pertinent research and related issues, practices, or cases discussed in the Situating the Case section and in professional communication in general.

Strongly Agree	Agree	Somewhat Agree	Somewhat Disagree	Disagree	Strongly Disagree
6	5	4	3	2	1

Notes on Results/Discussion:

Comment Category 9: Conclusions

This section describes implications for teachers and trainers in the field of professional communication. It describes classroom and workplace implications, and links the conclusions to the literature. It addresses the limitations (author was developer rather than third party; missing information; missing ethics approval for in-depth analysis of students; etc.). Finally, it suggests further research, if applicable.

Strongly Agree	Agree	Somewhat Agree	Somewhat Disagree	Disagree	Strongly Disagree
6	5	4	3	2	1

Notes on Conclusions:

Comment Category 10: Reviewer Notes

Please provide any additional integrative notes on the manuscript related to your publishing recommendation. Please pay special attention to the content of the manuscript in relationship to the study sections noted above.

Note: If the manuscript exceeds 7500 words, excluding references, please suggest how the author might cut the manuscript to comply with that limit.